

**PASSION BEYOND DEATH? TRACING *WUTHERING HEIGHTS* IN  
STEPHENIE MEYER'S *ECLIPSE***

MARTA MIQUEL BALDELLOU  
*University of Lleida*

**ABSTRACT.** *Stephenie Meyers' Twilight tetralogy has lately become an enormously successful phenomenon in contemporary popular fiction, especially among a young adult readership. Regarded as a mixture of genres, the Twilight series can be described as a paradigm of contemporary popular-culture gothic romance. Stephenie Meyer has recently acknowledged she bore one literary classic in mind when writing each of the volumes in the series. In particular, her third book, Eclipse (2007), is loosely based on Emily Brontë's Victorian classic Wuthering Heights (1847). This paper aims at providing a comparative analysis of both Brontë's novel and Meyer's adaptation, taking into consideration the way the protofeminist discourse that underlines Brontë's text is not only subverted but also acquires significantly reactionary undertones in Meyer's popular romance despite its contemporariness.*

*Keywords:* Popular fiction, Victorian novel, gothic romance, intertextuality, protofeminist interpretation, reactionary discourse.

## ¿PASIÓN TRAS LA MUERTE? TRAS LA PISTA DE CUMBRES BORRASCOSAS EN *ECLIPSE* DE STEPHENIE MEYER

**RESUMEN.** *La tetralogía de Crepúsculo de Stephenie Meyers se ha convertido en un fenómeno enormemente exitoso en la ficción popular contemporánea, especialmente entre el público joven adulto. Considerada como una mezcla de géneros, la serie literaria de Crepúsculo puede describirse como claro exponente literario de la cultura popular romántico-gótica. Stephenie Meyer recientemente ha confirmado tener una novela clásica en mente cuando escribía cada uno de los libros de la serie. En particular, su tercer libro, Eclipse (2007), está basado libremente en el clásico victoriano de Emily Brontë, Cumbres borrascosas (1847). Este artículo pretende ofrecer un análisis comparativo entre la novela de Brontë y la adaptación de Meyer, tomando en consideración el modo en que el discurso profeminista que puede identificarse en el texto de Brontë no sólo es subvertido sino que adquiere matices significativamente reaccionarios en la novela popular romántica de Meyer pese a su contemporaneidad.*

*Palabras clave:* Ficción popular, novela victoriana, romance gótico, intertextualidad, interpretación profeminista, discurso reaccionario.

*Received 21 February 2011*

*Revised version accepted 17 September 2012*

### 1. INTRODUCTION: GOTHIC ROMANCE, THE DISCOURSE OF FEMININITY AND NEO-VICTORIAN FICTION

According to Chase (1986), in the centennial year of Emily Brontë's novel, it was claimed that, when *Wuthering Heights* was published in 1847, it was widely dismissed as a coarse, immoral and subversive novel. From that time onwards, feminist critics have cherished Emily Brontë as a Romantic rebel who made passion part of the novelistic tradition against the repressive conventions prevailing at the time, even if the Brontës always remained essentially Victorian, since the happy marriages at the end of their novels tend to underline the triumph of a sentimental point of view, thus highlighting a solid preference for domesticity (Chase 1986: 33). *Wuthering Heights* has thus been received with "both condemnation and grudging praise" since its publication (Alexander and Smith 2003: 561). If early readers were shocked by Heathcliff's raw emotions, later readers have been fascinated by his enigmatic nature as a great demonic hero, illustrative of the romantic spirit of the age. Likewise, women writers who began their literary career in the 1840s began to seek heroines who would combine strength and intelligence with feminine tenderness (Showalter 1999:

100), selecting Catherine Earnshaw, Cathy, as a paradigmatic heroine that would reverberate in the literary imagination up to our days.

Taking into consideration both the sentimental and feminist discourse through which Emily Brontë's gothic Victorian classic has traditionally been interpreted, Neo-Victorian novels and popular culture have often looked for inspiration in nineteenth-century literary classics to revise and transform some of the most well-known and successful stories in contemporary best-sellers. Since the field of research of Neo-Victorian studies is simply emerging, the standards by means of which works can be described as Neo-Victorian seem to be still in the making at this stage. Within the literary theoretical framework of postmodernism, Neo-Victorian fiction revises, subverts, and transforms different tenets of Victorian discourses in an attempt to get closer to a past period that, at first sight, seems insurmountable. Because of the recent emergence of Neo-Victorian studies, which is the critical apparatus that analyses Neo-Victorian fiction, according to Kohlke there are still missing definitions that "delineate possible generic, chronological, and aesthetic boundaries" (2008: 2). This is precisely the reason why currently Neo-Victorian studies should adopt its widest possible interpretation, thus including "the whole of the nineteenth-century, its cultural discourses and products, and their abiding legacies, not just within British and British colonial contests and not necessarily coinciding with Queen Victoria's realm" (Kohlke 2008: 2). This broad definition of the texts which shape the corpus of Neo-Victorian studies has recently incorporated exponents of contemporary popular culture, which appropriate nineteenth-century textualities, rendering them more suitable and, to use Kohlke's words, significantly more "appealing to present-day sensibilities" (2008: 11). Within the domain of popular culture, a recent case in point is Stephenie Meyer's *Twilight* series, which has recently become particularly successful among a young adult readership.

Even though its mixture of romance and horror in a contemporary setting may account for some of its extraordinary success and popularity, Stephenie Meyer seems to exemplify T. S. Eliot's commitment to both tradition and the individual talent since she has acknowledged each book of her *Twilight* series was inspired by a different literary classic (Proctor 2008). If *New Moon* (2006) and *Breaking Dawn* (2008) bear a close resemblance with Shakespeare's *Romeo and Juliet* and *Midsummer Night's Dream* respectively, the first book of the series, *Twilight*, appeared to be clearly inspired by Jane Austen's *Pride and Prejudice*, while *Eclipse* (2007) includes explicit references to Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights* and parallel episodes all through its text that strongly resemble this early Victorian classic. In this respect, taking into account Stephenie Meyer's acknowledged tribute to *Wuthering Heights* in the third volume of her tetralogy,

together with explicit references to Emily Brontë's novel within the text and striking similarities in terms of its plot, it may be argued that Meyer's *Eclipse* arises as an illustrative example of a popular culture novel with remarkable Neo-Victorian undertones. According to Krueger, contemporary interdisciplinary exponents of the arts that refer back to the Victorian era enormously contribute to the phenomenon of Victorian revivalism to the extent it is claimed that, in our society, at large, "Victorian culture has probably never been more popular and influential" (2002: xiii) as it has become nowadays.

Hence, bearing in mind Meyer's tribute to some nineteenth-century literary classics, some volumes of her tetralogy, and especially, her novel *Eclipse*, may be explored from a different perspective apart from regarding her novels as a sociological phenomenon which has acquired remarkable popularity among young adult readers. In this respect, Meyer's novel *Eclipse* can be interpreted as a contemporary popular-culture paradigm of intertextual revision and transformation of a Victorian canonical work, Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights*. Taking this premise as a point of departure, it may be questioned to what extent the perspective taken in Meyer's volume in relation to Brontë's canonical novel contributes to subverting or prolonging the domestic as well as the profeminist discourse that underlines this Victorian classic. In this context, Joyce (2002) aptly refers to the image of a rear-view mirror, arguing that the view of our past is necessarily mediated, thus rendering the Victorians as distorted and closer to our times than they might appear at first sight, therefore claiming that postmodern and contemporary approaches to the Victorian period often exhibit a binary opposition in relation to our contemporariness, that is, we attempt to define ourselves in opposition to our past. Accordingly, Neo-Victorian fiction, or literary texts with Neo-Victorian undertones, often reveal more of our contemporary epistemology than about the actual past period they seek to portray.

Despite Meyer's evident legacy to Brontë, as this paper aims to show, her novel *Eclipse* can hardly be alleged to illustrate the profeminist discourse in which Brontë's original text began to engage, which came hand in hand with a domestic discourse as a legacy to the eighteenth-century sentimental novel from which it arose. Thus, this article will mainly take into account the profeminist discourse that underlines Brontë's text and will juxtapose it with Meyer's reactionary discourse in her novel *Eclipse*, despite its contemporariness, thus claiming that Brontë's text can ultimately be regarded as significantly more profeminist than Meyer's contemporary novel inspired by this Victorian classic. If *Wuthering Heights* has often been described as a blending of eighteenth-century sentimental and nineteenth-century gothic novels, mainly dwelling into

the domain of realism with important romantic features, Meyer's series is often catalogued as contemporary popular gothic romance.

The Victorian discourses of domesticity and female purity preached a single version of ideal femininity, whereby women were both protected and oppressed (Moran 2006). Religious, medical and psychological discourses at the time associated femininity with innocence, purity and passivity, thus justifying the exclusion of women from institutions of power. This view of women was further emphasised through the separation of spheres, which John Ruskin (1865) addressed stating that women were particularly suited to the domestic realm, while men were best prepared for the active domain of public life. These ideas gave shape to the perception of women as spiritually inspiring, culminating in Coventry Patmore's (1866) metaphor of the Victorian woman as the angel of the house. Nonetheless, this Victorian discourse of pure womanhood, envisioning women as deprived of power and untainted by sexuality, was often counteracted by the contemporary cultural upheaval caused by the so-called 'woman question', which began to arise as a result of women's changing expectations about their role as well as their need to show they could succeed outside the domestic domain. Hence, despite the ethics of female domesticity that prevailed in Victorian literature as legacy of the eighteenth-century sentimental novel, likewise, some Victorian women writers became mediators of a protofeminist discourse that, slowly but surely, also began to take shape.

In spite of this truly ambiguous situation prevailing in Victorian times, some novels with Neo-Victorian undertones, often consist in appropriations of the past rendering an oversimplified version of reality, focusing on an idealised interpretation of chaste womanhood, as is the case with Stephenie Meyer's *Eclipse*, or rather, offering an overtly sexualised vision of Victorian life, thus none of them ultimately producing a picture faithful enough to reality. Neo-Victorian novels often tend to reveal more about twenty-first century-discourses than actual Victorian interpretations of reality. In this respect, Michel Foucault ponders about this thesis with regard to sexuality, wondering whether Victorians could be truly characterised as sexually repressed in comparison with apparently sex-saturated postmoderns (Kukich and Sadoff 2000: xviii), and finally claiming that, precisely because of the assumed Victorian concern about sexual repression, Victorians could ultimately be heralded as pioneers of sexual self-realisation, as opposed to views traditionally held about Victorian prudish ways.

Likewise, Stephenie Meyer's novel, *Eclipse* must also be necessarily interpreted within the broader context of gothic tradition, which ultimately determines the discourse of gender and sexuality that mostly prevails in the story. In this sense, according to David Stevens, feminist interpretations of the gothic

have drawn attention to issues related to the condition of women such as the relative silence and passivity of many female characters in gothic tales, the stereotyping of female characters from a male perspective, the enclosure and confinement of heroines in castles or abbeys, and the punishment of those women who dare trespass the limits of decency according to Victorian precepts and gender conventions (2010: 108). Hence, the ultimate morale addressed to women readers that is ingrained within the classic gothic genre seems not far removed from that of fairy tales addressed to children. In this respect, Isabella dreads the mere presence of Manfred in Sir Horace Walpole's quintessential gothic classic *The Castle of Otranto* (1764), just as Little Red Riding Hood flees from the wolf in Charles Perrault's fairy tale. This moralising message and iconography from fairy tales, as well as its marked discourse about gender conventions, is also vividly present in Meyer's novel, as the wolf or the vampire, literally personified by Jacob and Edward, are present to tease Bella as soon as she dares trespass the limits considered appropriate to women, for instance, when she takes the initiative or makes decisions on her own and is consequently reprimanded.

Within the framework of gothic tradition, and the reactionary discourse that it often defends, the fallen women or madwomen that arouse male fear and hatred must be ultimately punished or ostracised, while submissive women that behave appropriately are ultimately rewarded with praise, marriage and sanctification. This was usually the literary formula that prevailed within gothic romance, as a clear legacy of Samuel Richardson's novels of sensibility featuring virtuous heroines that were ultimately rewarded if they acted according to sanctioned precepts. In this sense, Meyer's tetralogy is also deeply indebted to the tradition of the gothic romance with the corresponding moralising message of the heroine behaving according to decorum so as to ultimately be rewarded.

Nonetheless, the reactionary discourse that was traditionally perceived as prevailing in the gothic genre, was eventually subverted and reinterpreted through feminist perspectives. In this respect, as Ferguson Ellis (2000) claims, in the 1970s, Ellen Moers perceived the female gothic, like in Ann Radcliffe's novels, as a feminine substitute for the picaresque, where heroines could enjoy all the adventures masculine heroes often experienced. Hence, exponents of the gothic genre began to be interpreted through a new light. As a case in point, to use Botting's words, Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights*, through Cathy's rebellious passions, appeared to be a "refusal of the niceties of domestic passivity, propriety and duty [...] thus signalling an untamed and wild invasion of the home rather than comfortable domestication" (2004: 129). Even if Stephenie Meyer is probably aware of some feminist discourse underlying the

female gothic tradition, she has not picked up the same cue in her novels as Bella Swan is well-known precisely for her clumsy ways and her reluctance to take part in any kind of physical effort.

Therefore, Meyer's more traditionally feminine rather than feminist discourse renders her novels much closer to romance within contemporary popular fiction, as her discourse seeks to reflect that of her female readers within the social, cultural and religious context of a reactionary, capitalist, and Republican American society. Likewise, Stephenie Meyer's cultural and religious upbringing within the Mormon faith is also key to understand her novels. In this sense, all characters in her novels display highly moral behaviour and exquisite manners, despite the fact that most of them are teenagers. In terms of sexuality, resisting temptation and the discourse of abstinence prevail through most novels of Meyer's vampire tetralogy, creating a combination of desire and restraint that merely ends up in sexual tension. This underlying message in her novels is thus rooted in the moralistic world of fairy tales and the reactionary discourse that often characterises the tradition of gothic romance as well as romance novels in popular culture.

Moreover, as Kucich and Sadoff argue, Neo-Victorian texts also often emerge as a result of the diversification of the cultural marketplace, "recalling a time when High culture was 'popular', as the postmodern-Victorian mode both reifies a lost era of high culture and popularises its imitations" (2000: xi). Thus, popular literary texts with Neo-Victorian undertones often look back to the Victorian period, when the present-day canonical works they acclaim were highly popular, with the view to popularise these canonical works once again. In this respect, within the domain of popular and consumer culture, Hoppenstand, in his anthology of popular fiction, claims that the romance story arises as the most commercially successful in popular culture, and yet, still remains as perhaps the least critically regarded category (1997: 127). Some feminist critics dismiss popular romance for its inherent reactionary discourse (Batsleer 1997), while others interpret romance as fiction that explores women's dissatisfaction and offers an illusory attempt to cope with women's condition, in Light's words, "a postponement of fulfilment" (1997: 224).

Likewise, following Stoneman, poststructuralist theories have encouraged to perceive high and low culture – no matter how blurring this distinction is – as a continuum of textuality produced by the intersection of cultural forces which determine the way these texts are received and transmitted (1996: 1). Some Neo-Victorian contemporary works also tend to portray the nineteenth-century as a commodity, thus, according to Kucich and Sadoff, the contemporary consumer culture often shares the postmodern nostalgia for the nineteenth-century, using the

Victorian past to “aestheticize contemporary reality” (xii). Consequently, it can be argued that, even if Meyer’s *Eclipse* is set in the contemporary American society, the tribute to Brontë’s eponymous novel, along with the pervading presence of vampires as archetypal characters in nineteenth-century, seem to be enough evidence to describe Meyer’s novel as remarkably Neo-Victorian, making use of a sort of nineteenth-century revivalism to attract a contemporary readership. Thus, a comparative study between both novels will also serve the purpose of analysing the transformation of Brontë’s Victorian classic to suit contemporary demands.

Thus, even if Meyer’s *Eclipse* cannot be regarded as a Neo-Victorian novel strictly speaking, the vampirical tradition it adopts, as well as its reiterative references to Brontë’s novel, render it a contemporary novel with remarkable Neo-Victorian features. Actually, as Kohlke argues, the spiritualist or haunting trope, the gothic, which characterises Meyer’s novel, is frequently used in Neo-Victorian fiction as both a “metaphor and analogy for our attempted dialogue with the dead and for the lingering traces of the past within the present [...] as the compulsion to repeat the past that has not, as yet, been adequately processed” (2008: 9). Likewise, Kaplan also makes reference to the important role gothic elements play in Neo-Victorian works claiming they often deal with “the mix of familiarity and strangeness which Freud theorised as the uncanny” (2007: 11), and which arises as a result of the ultimate impossibility to come to terms with a past historical period from a contemporary perspective. Meyer’s tetralogy is thus deeply rooted in the vampiric tradition, making use of the revivalism of nineteenth-century novels and gothic archetypes, even if set in the present-day society, so as to suit contemporary audiences and blend realistic and fantastic elements, contributing to the idealisation of the Victorian past personified by the vampire figure.

A comparative and intertextual analysis of Brontë’s and Meyer’s texts, especially focused on the love triangle set among the three leading characters in each of the novels, will bring to the floor the transformation of Brontë’s discourse into Meyer’s novel, as well as Meyer’s ultimate aim to popularise a Victorian classic with a view to reach the young adult public, envisioning the nineteenth-century as a contemporary commodity, by means of a process of idealisation and oversimplification that arises as a result of her attempt to come to terms with the Victorian past from a contemporary and popular-culture perspective.

## 2 BELLA SWAN AND CATHY EARNSHAW IN THE MIRROR

*Eclipse* (2007) is the third novel in Stephenie Meyer’s popular best-selling *Twilight* series. In *Twilight* (2005) and *New Moon* (2006) the love story between the vampire Edward Cullen and the mortal Bella Swan begins to take shape, while



Edward, well-aware of the risk Bella is taking for his own sake, decides to end their relationship to Bella's own benefit. Unable to cope with Edward's absence, Bella gets closer to her childhood friend, Jacob Black, a Native-American werewolf, although she finally decides to commit suicide. Due to a misunderstanding, Edward believes Bella dead and decides to kill himself as a result. Nonetheless, aided by Edward's sister, Alice, Bella manages to prevent his death and they both resume their former relationship.

Taking into consideration these precedents, *Eclipse* focuses on the love triangle established from then onwards among Edward, Bella and Jacob. After Edward's return, Bella is unable to forget Jacob and the fact that he is suffering for her sake. Despite Edward's reluctance, Bella frequently visits Jacob and his wolf pack at the reserve in La Push, while Edward finally proposes marriage to Bella. In the meantime, an army of newborn vampires under the command of Victoria, whose partner James was killed by Edward, arrives at Forks to seek revenge. In spite of their ancestral enmity, the Cullens join forces with Jacob's wolf pack to defeat the threatening army of newborn vampires. Unable to accept the engagement between Edward and Bella, Jacob reveals he plans to join the fight and get himself killed. Bella intends to prevent Jacob's plans, realising she is also in love with Jacob, even though she confesses her love for Edward is so unfathomable that she would willingly agree to sacrifice her mortal life and become a vampire so as to seal their compromise.

All through Meyer's novel *Eclipse*, Bella acknowledges, on many occasions, that she is reading Emily Brontë's novel again, while the actions taking place in *Wuthering Heights* as Bella peruses them seem to reflect the parallel experiences Bella undergoes in the novel fairly closely, thus producing a meaningful mirror effect. In this respect, drawing on Kucich and Sadoff, it can be argued that Bella constructs a history of the present by rewriting this Victorian past, thus perceiving the present as history, distancing herself from her immediacy (2000: xiv). Likewise, at the opening of *Eclipse*, Bella and Edward have just resumed their relationship after his long absence when Bella admits she is browsing through Emily Brontë's novel again, just getting close "to the part where Heathcliff returns" (7). Bella's constant need to reread *Wuthering Heights* seems particularly significant as, even if unconsciously, she begins to identify similarities in the relationship established between Heathcliff and Cathy in Brontë's novel and her own relationship with Edward Cullen. Consequently, an intertextual pattern can be gradually traced between Brontë's gothic domestic novel and Meyer's contemporary gothic romance.

Likewise, Edward constantly scorns Bella for reading the same book once more, as he believes Heathcliff to be a despicable character. Unable to gain

insight into the reasons why Bella pursues her reading of this Victorian classic again, Edward strongly advises her not to fall in love with someone as selfish and malignant as Heathcliff, even if acknowledging “Catherine is really the source of all the trouble, not Heathcliff” (25). Unlike Bella, Edward is ironically unable to perceive any parallelism between Brontë’s novel and their own relationship, even if Bella points at the inevitability of their love as well as the impossibility to keep both lovers apart despite Cathy’s selfishness, Heathcliff’s evil, or even their death. Bella is also the source of all problems in Meyer’s novel since her falling in love with Edward condemns her to a life of damnation in the underworld. Similarly, in Brontë’s novel, Cathy’s gradual attachment to Heathcliff, a gypsy, also threatens to disrupt the boundaries separating the social classes to which both characters belong. In this respect, Edward often teases Bella asking: “do you ever think that your life might be easier if you weren’t in love with me?” (204), thus identifying himself ironically, even if in a subtle way, with the demonic hero in Brontë’s novel. Nonetheless, despite the fact Bella is aware of all the risks she is taking, she gladly succumbs to what she perceives to be her fate. In a well-known interpretation of *Wuthering Heights*, Gilbert and Gubar (1984) appropriately referred to the fact “the similarity of Isabella’s and Catherine’s fates suggests that ‘to fall’ and ‘to fall in love’ are equivalents, so the bridle or bridal hook is an apt, punning metaphor for the institution of marriage” (289). In Bella’s case, her prospective marriage to Edward literally implies ‘a fall’, since her wedding would officially sanction her transformation into a vampire and thus the closure of her mortal existence.

It is not until the moment that Jacob Black menaces to disrupt Bella’s devotion to her vampire that Edward really begins to sympathise with Heathcliff, also feeling the need to revise some passages from Brontë’s novel while Bella is asleep. To Bella’s surprise, Edward finally discloses he has realised he can sympathise with Heathcliff in ways he had not thought possible before. When Edward left Bella, well-aware that their relationship posed a serious threat to Bella’s safety, Jacob established a closer link with her to the extent their former friendship transformed into something deeper. Jacob’s constant presence and support nurtured a love triangle that began to take shape in *New Moon* and is fully displayed in *Eclipse*. Despite Bella’s evident attachment to Edward, her feelings grow more insecure due to Jacob’s presence, thus realising she is also feeling increasingly attracted towards Jacob. Thus, if Edward admits his sympathy for Heathcliff, Bella identifies with Cathy Earnshaw as she also faces a dilemma, unable to choose between her love for Heathcliff and the economic security and social status with which Edgar Linton may provide her. As Bella argues: “I was like Cathy, like *Wuthering Heights*, only my options were so much better

than hers, neither one evil, neither one weak. And here I sat, crying about it, not doing anything productive to make it right. Just like Cathy." (459)

Bella feels trapped in her incapacity to make the right choice with regard to her two suitors, Edward and Jacob; a situation that closely resembles Cathy's inability to choose between Heathcliff and Edgar. Nonetheless, Bella believes Cathy's decision involves choosing between evil and weakness, meaning Heathcliff and Edgar, whereas her own choice entails a greater difficulty than Cathy's alternative since, from her perspective, Edward and Jacob significantly present more complex features. Bella's words ultimately imply her interpretation of Heathcliff and Edgar is fairly Manichean, as she describes the former as inherently evil, while Edgar arises as Heathcliff's true opposite since Bella believes him to personify sheer weakness. In this respect, Bella's Manichean interpretation of Brontë's novel and its male heroes, Heathcliff and Edgar, as flat characters seems to respond to Krueger's thesis about postmodernist responses to the Victorian period as exhibiting a remarkably dominant binary opposition (2002: xv). Consequently, Bella, as a postmodern reader of a Victorian novel, is able to identify with Cathy, but unable to gain insight into the more intricate nature of both Heathcliff and Edgar, thus simplifying Brontë's novel quite ostensibly from a contemporary perspective. Consequently, Bella is ultimately reinterpreting a classic and popularising it by means of simplifying its thesis. Actually, despite the fact Bella believes Cathy is in an easier position than she is because of the clear opposition established between Heathcliff and Edgar, Bella seems unaware of the fact Cathy is also unable to choose between both suitors due to their intricate nature. Moreover, if Bella seems ultimately able to identify with Cathy, but easily dismisses Heathcliff as evil and Edgar as weak, Edward increasingly grows more attached to Heathcliff but accuses Cathy to be the source of all problems. Thus, eventually, both Bella and Edward are able to understand Cathy and Heathcliff respectively, but cannot gain insight into the nature of their respective partners, blaming them for the situation in which they find themselves. Even though Bella and Edward are unable to give voice to this inconvenience explicitly, their reading of Brontë's novel and their interpretation of its main episodes run parallel to their development as characters.

In relation to *Wuthering Heights*, even if Edward will gradually identify with Heathcliff, at first he advises Bella to have better sense than Cathy and refuse to succumb to someone as malignant as Heathcliff. Edward thus initially grows detached from Heathcliff due to the evil nature he identifies in Brontë's male character. Nonetheless, Edward is a vampire, and, as such, he is supposed to murder and snatch in order to pursue his immortal existence, thus his nature is not entirely different from that of Heathcliff, if not even worse. Edward only

perceives Cathy's whimsical behaviour and the pain she causes to both Edgar and Heathcliff, and despite his blatant dark nature, Edward, ironically enough, feels unable to sympathise with Heathcliff. As legacy and homage to Rice's (2008) kind-hearted and peaceful vampire, Louis, Edward and the Cullens refuse to drink human blood and thus only nourish on animal blood, declining any display of their presumed evil nature as vampires. Nonetheless, it is precisely when Edward perceives Bella grows more attached to Jacob that his jealousy renders him more daring and ferocious, thus beginning to sympathise with Heathcliff for the first time and identifying with the romantic demonic hero. Significantly, Bella finds Edward reading through some chapters of *Wuthering Heights*, and when the book falls open by accident, a passage particularly catches Bella's attention inasmuch as it reminds her of Edward. This excerpt is uttered by Heathcliff when Nelly lets him know another encounter between rivals Heathcliff and Edgar would surely undermine Cathy's declining health even more. It is at this point Heathcliff's both dark and noble nature is revealed as he feels determined to see Cathy again. In Meyer's novel, Bella rereads this episode as follows:

And there you see the distinction between our feelings: had he been in my place and I in his, though I hated him with a hatred that turned my life to gall, I never would have raised a hand against him. You may look incredulous, if you please! I never would have banished him from her society as long as she desired his. The moment her regard ceased, I would have torn his heart out, and drank his blood! But, till then – if you don't believe me, you don't know me – till then, I would have died by inches before I touched a single hair of his head! (236)

This quotation is an extract from chapter fourteen of Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights*, which Bella reproduces literally. Therefore, Bella is well-aware that Edward could have also used Heathcliff's words to describe the way he feels towards Jacob as well as to show his devotion to Bella, thus she implicitly sets a parallelism between Edward and Heathcliff. In Brontë's novel, Nelly accuses Heathcliff of ruining all hopes of Cathy's improvement by returning after his long absence to find Cathy married to Edgar. Nonetheless, despite Nelly's reprobation of Heathcliff's intrinsic hostility, he also displays his profound nobility and respect for Cathy's wishes as he admits he would never hurt Edgar as long as Cathy loved him. Heathcliff's precise words, "I would have torn his heart out, and drank his blood" (Brontë, 139) are especially enlightening for Bella, as Edward's vampiric nature is significantly reminiscent of Heathcliff's violent and dark temperament. Both in Brontë's novel and Meyer's neo-gothic adaptation of the text, this episode proves pivotal for the development of the

story as both Cathy and Bella begin to gain insight into the complexity of both their own feelings and those of their respective partners. Heathcliff's elopement somehow prompts Cathy's closer attachment to Edgar in clear resemblance with Edward's absence, which contributes to Bella's increasing affection for Jacob.

Bella's identification with Cathy gains depth all through Meyer's novel, as Bella rereads *Wuthering Heights*, and Edward also recites some significant passages due to his photographic memory as a vampire. Nonetheless, towards the end of the novel, Bella shows her disaffection for Cathy agreeing with Edward that she is the source of all the troubles arising in Brontë's novel, thus leading Bella to feel utterly guilty for having hurt both Edward and Jacob owing to her irresolution. According to Bella, Cathy is to be blamed for her hesitation as well as for her final choice, that is, social status and economic security, personified by Edgar, as opposed to what she perceives to be true love, her profound attachment to Heathcliff. Conversely, while Edward firstly believed Heathcliff to be utterly malignant, he feels more inclined to sympathise with Brontë's hero, especially due to the ancestral enmity established with Jacob, which is rooted in the ancient rivalry between vampires and werewolves. The antagonism between representatives of both supernatural factions brings both Edward and Jacob closer to Heathcliff and Edgar, as ultimate heirs to *Wuthering Heights* and Thrushcross Grange. When Edward firstly discovers Bella reading *Wuthering Heights*, he states: "it isn't a love story, it's a hate story" (25), thus showing his disapproval, unable to perceive any similarity between Brontë's narrative and the situation in which he and Bella are involved. Nonetheless, towards the closing of Meyer's novel, both Bella and Edward acknowledge their debt to Cathy and Heathcliff. Despite the fact that Bella believes Cathy's behaviour cannot possibly be redeemed, Cathy's eternal attachment to Heathcliff entices Bella to envision her final transformation into a vampire to certify her never-ending engagement to Edward. Similarly, even if Edward firstly scorned Heathcliff's dubious deeds, he eventually cites one of Heathcliff's most well-known quotes to show Bella his devotion:

'Heathcliff has his moments, too,' he said. He didn't need the book to get it word perfect. He pulled me closer and whispered in my ear, 'I cannot live without my life! I cannot live without my soul!'  
'Yes,' I said quietly. 'That's my point.' (541)

In Brontë's novel, Heathcliff delivers this soliloquy after Cathy's death, begging Cathy to curse him and haunt him for all eternity. At the end of Meyer's novel, Bella is engaged to Edward, taking for granted their marriage would only officially sanctify Bella's willing transformation into a vampire. In Brontë's novel, Cathy

ultimately dies after giving birth to her daughter Catherine, and it is assumed her weak condition, despite her youth, is due to her impossibility to join Heathcliff in real life, since she is married to Edgar, and Heathcliff got married to Isabella so as to punish Cathy for having chosen Edgar during his absence. Nonetheless, Bella gladly agrees to sacrifice her mortal life so as to become a vampire and spend the rest of her days near Edward. Bella is thus eager to complain about Cathy's vacillation but unable to notice the fact that Cathy's choice of Edgar over Heathcliff responded to the Victorian constraints of the time regarding class and race. As Bella herself acknowledges, as opposed to Cathy, she really has a choice to spend her mortal existence with Jacob and thus reject to sacrifice her own life to be with Edward for all eternity. In this respect, it can be argued that Meyer's novel underlines a more reactionary discourse than Brontë's classic text, as Bella gladly accepts to die to fulfil an idyllic love rather than accepting to give free vent to an actual and physical relationship with Jacob. Thus, Cathy's ultimate union with Heathcliff remains ideal as it was impossible to fulfil in real life owing to Victorian standards. Nonetheless, Bella's will to die so as to fulfil her love for Edward involves a willing sacrifice in favour of ideal love as opposed to real passion despite Meyer's novel's evident contemporariness.

### 3. EDWARD CULLEN AS BOTH A DEMONIC HERO AND A NEO-VICTORIAN ARISTOCRAT

Even if Bella is fond of reading *Wuthering Heights* and establish obvious links between the plot of the Victorian classic and her own situation, to Bella's mind, the love triangle established among Edward, Jacob and herself is further explored and subverted than the relationships among Heathcliff, Edgar and Cathy in Brontë's novel. Although Bella identifies with Cathy, Edward gradually grows more attached to Heathcliff, and by extension, Jacob may fulfil Edgar's role in Meyer's novel, the parallelisms established between these pairs of characters is often problematised, especially with regard to Edward and Jacob, and their indebtedness to Brontë's male characters. Even though Edward seems to be Heathcliff's counterpart in Meyer's novel, he presents many points in common with Edgar, and conversely, Jacob's features bear a significant close resemblance with those of Heathcliff, despite the fact he apparently plays the part of Edgar in Meyer's novel.

Since he was transformed into a vampire, Edward has lived with the Cullens, a family of vampires that have managed to suppress their deadly instincts. Despite his evil nature as a creature of the night, Edward feeds on animals rather than human beings, thus showing he is inherently kind-hearted, regardless of his

lethal capacity for destruction. His immortal existence changes when he meets Bella, a mortal teenager, at the high school of Forks, falling in love with her despite his initial reluctance. As a vampire, Edward possesses the supernatural ability of reading people's minds. Nonetheless, Bella seems immune to his power as a human, which only increases Edward's fascination for her. When Edward decides to leave Bella to protect her life as a mortal being, Jacob, a childhood friend, grows more attached to Bella, thus beginning a new relationship which is hampered and finally brought to a halt when Edward comes back, unable to forget Bella.

Like Heathcliff, Edward is an outcast as far as he remains different and separate from the rest of the teenagers in Forks. In Brontë's novel, Heathcliff is a gypsy orphan brought to *Wuthering Heights* by Mr. Earnshaw, who takes pity on him as he sees the young boy rambling in the streets of Liverpool. While Hindley abuses Heathcliff and treats him as a servant, Catherine grows more attached to him until Heathcliff falls in love with her. A social and racial difference separates Heathcliff from Catherine, since Heathcliff is not only a humble orphan but he is also a gypsy. Conversely, Catherine, a spoiled and whimsical young girl, belongs to the upper-middle-class and, well-aware of social conventions, aspires to acquire social prominence through her recent attachment to the Lintons.

The disparity of social origins which keeps Heathcliff and Catherine apart is maintained in Meyer's novel as Bella is a mortal young girl and Edward belongs to the underworld due to his vampiric condition. In clear parallelism with Heathcliff, Edward arises as a demonic hero, as a legacy of romanticism, connected with the rebellious forces of nature and endowed with preternatural powers that defy logic and reason. As a result of Hindley's constant humiliation, and especially due to Catherine's intention to marry Edgar, Heathcliff decides to run away when he overhears Catherine telling Nelly she would degrade herself marrying him. During his absence, Heathcliff plans to seek revenge for a life of humiliation and for Cathy's final decision to acquire social status rather than fulfilling her love for him. Eventually, Heathcliff comes back as a self-made man, smart and wealthy, and powerful enough to take revenge on Hindley and on Cathy's decision to marry Edgar. Similarly, at the opening of *Eclipse*, Edward also returns to Forks to find Bella in a closer relationship with Jacob, who has grown more attached to her during Edward's absence. While Heathcliff shows a clear change between his former humble situation and his newly-acquired social status after his return, seeking revenge for his previous suffering, Edward arrives at Forks to remain closer to Bella and prevent a further attachment between Jacob and Bella.

In close resemblance with Heathcliff and Cathy, Edward initiates Bella in the course of love. However, the passionate love that ties Heathcliff and Cathy significantly differs from the apparently pure and chaste affection Edward and Bella feel for each other. Despite the fact that Edward awakens Bella's passion, he feels the need to discourage her advances before their marriage as he knows he may easily put Bella's life in jeopardy should he give free vent to his instinct as a vampire. All through Meyer's novel, there is a clear connection established between Bella's loss of virginity and her transformation into a vampire. In this respect, Edward's cool and rational mindset clearly differs from Heathcliff's passionate and instinctive nature. Actually, both Heathcliff and Edward know their love for Cathy and Bella may only be fulfilled in the afterlife, when they may be dissolved into their double (Davies, 1998: 75), their twin soul, that is to say, Cathy and Bella, respectively. Heathcliff's gypsy origins and Edward's vampiric condition thus prevent any prospective attempt at an official compromise.

In Brontë's novel, soon after he arrives at Wuthering Heights, Lockwood becomes well aware of Cathy's ghostly presence, who entices Heathcliff to leave his mortal existence and fulfil their love in the afterlife. Similarly, in Meyer's novel, Bella tries to convince Edward to transform her into a vampire and seal their union for eternity. Due to Edward's high sense of responsibility, quite opposed to Bella's instinctive behaviour, which also renders her closer to Heathcliff, her ultimate rite of passage - becoming a vampire - does not take place until they are married so that a significant correspondence is established between Bella's virginity and her wish to relinquish her mortal life. Meyer's reactionary discourse is blatant and significantly remindful of Foucault's history of sexuality, which ultimately locates the Victorians as "a convenient yet unreliable 'other' for late-twentieth-century sexed individuals" (Kucich and Sadoff 2000: xviii). Nonetheless, despite contemporary interpretations of the Victorian period as a particularly repressed era in terms of sexuality, Foucault argued that the Victorians produced sexuality rather than repressed it, thus becoming forerunners of sexual self-realization. Hence, Meyer seems to simplify the Victorian discourse of sexuality as pure and ideal as opposed to sex-saturated postmodern perspectives, indulging in an oversimplified interpretation of the past.

Edward's relationship with Bella also resembles that of Heathcliff and Cathy inasmuch as it is constantly discouraged by surrounding factors. Their relationship is often doomed to failure due to Edward's condition as a vampire and Bella's mortal existence. Unable to understand Edward's behaviour when he decides to abandon Bella for her own sake, Bella's father, Charlie, grows



dissatisfied with Edward to the extent he forbids his daughter to see him again. Charlie's opposition is not entirely unlike that of Hindley in Brontë's novel, as Hindley frequently bans Heathcliff's presence in *Wuthering Heights*, especially after his father's demise, when he begins to treat Heathcliff as his own stable boy. Nonetheless, Charlie is totally unaware of the fact that Edward's vampiric condition endows him with the ability to climb to Bella's room every night to protect her. If Bella's father tries to prevent his daughter's relationship with Edward, Bella's mother, Renée, who lives in Florida, is able to identify the special bond that unites both lovers thus arguing

'The way you move – you orient yourself around him without even thinking about it. When he moves, even a little bit, you adjust your position at the same time. Like magnets...or gravity. You're like a...satellite, or something. I've never seen anything like it' (61).

Even if they are far apart, Renée seems to be Nelly's counterpart in Brontë's novel, as she plays the part of her own daughter's close confidante.

The clandestine relationship Edward and Bella maintain at first urges them to meet in secret abodes, far removed from civilisation, such as the forest or the Cullens' mansion, far away from the town centre. In this respect, natural spaces such as the forest are reminiscent of the important connotations the moors acquire in Brontë's novel, as the only place, in the midst of nature, where Heathcliff and Cathy can possibly meet and remain together. Similarly, the window of Bella's bedroom is also remindful of the window of Cathy's bedroom, on which Cathy's ghost taps and Lockwood becomes aware of her presence. In this sense, a reversal of roles may be observed as, in Brontë's novel, it is Heathcliff who wishes to join Cathy in the afterlife, while, in Meyer's novel, Bella is at Edward's mercy to join him in his immortality.

Despite the numerous parallelisms that can be established between Heathcliff and Edward, Meyer's male protagonist in the *Twilight* series also shares many points in common with Edgar, Heathcliff's counterpart in *Wuthering Heights*. Well-bred but weak in appearance, Edgar stands for the perfect and ideal gentleman. His civilised manners as well as his social and economic status irremediably attract Cathy to the extent that she finally accepts his proposal of marriage. Even if Edward belongs to the underworld and conceals a definite dark nature, he also shares Edgar's aristocratic origins and lives in a mansion that rather resembles Thrushcross Grange. Moreover, Edward's civility and impeccable manners are often reminiscent of those of Edgar, and even if aptly capable of exerting violence, Edward's exquisite education overtly differs from Heathcliff's cruelty and thirst for revenge. Thus, Heathcliff's passion and

resolution to win Cathy back ultimately stand in sharp contrast with Edward's coolness and detached manner.

Similarly, when Jacob asks Bella to account for the reasons why she has chosen Edward instead of him, Jacob claims she may prefer Edward due to his good looks and his economic status. This episode in Meyer's novel resembles Nelly's questioning Cathy why she has decided to marry Edgar Linton. Cathy resolutely says that she loves "the ground under his feet, and the air over his head, and everything he touches, and every word he says [...] all his looks, and all his actions, and him entirely, and altogether" (84). In Meyer's novel, Bella confesses to Jacob she wished Edward was not so good-looking and so wealthy because she is certain she would still love him then. Bella's answer does not satisfy Jacob, unable to understand how Bella can be eager to sacrifice her life for a monster. Jacob's testimony bears a strong resemblance with Nelly's scepticism regarding Cathy's true motivation to marry Edgar to the extent both Nelly and Jacob are aware that Cathy and Bella are about to condemn themselves willingly to a life of unhappiness.

Even if the marriage of Bella and Edward conceals an alternative rite of passage, Bella's transformation into a vampire, Bella reluctantly accepts Edward's proposal as she cannot possibly understand why they have to get married at all since she is far too young to marry anyone by contemporary standards. Bella's need to release her passion is carefully counteracted by Edward's vow to preserve both his and her virtue until their compromise is officially sanctioned. Edward's sense of propriety and status consciousness renders him definitely closer to Edgar Linton than Heathcliff, as Edward often resembles a Victorian gentleman and could never be mistaken for a stable boy. Consequently, as happens in Brontë's novel, Bella is engaged to Edward as he promises to offer the protection she needs against the gang of vampires threatening Forks. Similarly, Cathy marries Edgar to acquire the social and economic status she has always desired since the moment she and Heathcliff escaped from Wuthering Heights to take a glimpse of the party the Lintons held at the Grange while they were hiding in the garden.

The Cullens, a family of vampires with aristocratic origins, also bear a close resemblance with the Lintons in Brontë's novel. The noble and upper-class manners that characterise Carlisle, the patriarchal figure of the Cullens, are not entirely different from those of Mr. Linton in Brontë's novel. If Edward seems to be Edgar's counterpart, Alice, Edward's sister, presents a close parallelism with Isabella, Edgar's sister in Brontë's novel. Like Isabella, Alice has been raised in a wealthy estate, and is quite fond of ostentation and wealth. When Cathy is attacked by a dog and needs to remain in Thrushcross Grange for some time,

Isabella becomes her close friend and aids significantly in transforming naughty Cathy into a real lady. Likewise, in Meyer's novel, Bella is frequently described as a working class girl, not particularly fond of trendy clothes and elegant celebrations. Alice often advises Bella how to dress, and feels particularly glad to organise her brother's wedding once she is informed Edward and Bella are engaged to be married.

Nonetheless, other characters may play the role of Isabella in Meyer's novel. Once Cathy is married to Edgar and Heathcliff returns to seek his revenge, Isabella falls in love with him and begins to nourish some kind of hatred towards Cathy, well-aware she may still feel some affection for Heathcliff. Isabella's jealousy for her sister-in-law is also personified in some characters in Meyer's novel such as Tanya, Victoria and Rosalie. Edward lets Bella know that, during his stay in Italy, one female vampire, Tanya, felt attracted to him but he declined her approach for the sake of Bella's love. Like Isabella, Tanya becomes Bella's rival to obtain Edward's favour. Moreover, in the first book of the *Twilight* series, Edward killed a vampire named James as he threatened to murder Bella. In due course, Victoria, James' fiancée, wishes Bella's death as she comes back to seek revenge. As is the case in Brontë's novel when Isabella wishes Cathy's death to begin a life of her own with Heathcliff, Victoria also wishes Bella's death to redeem her late lover's demise. Finally, in Meyer's novel, Rosalie, a newborn vampire, lets Bella know how she was transformed into a creature of the night so as to warn Bella to remain mortal as long as possible. Rosalie belonged to a wealthy family, and she was brutally attacked by her fiancée's friends to the point a vampire had to transform her into her present state so as to save her life. Rosalie confesses she wished she had been more humble, because in that case, she would not have attracted the attention of wicked men. Rosalie's upper-class manners and her noble origins are also strongly reminiscent of Isabella in Brontë's novel.

#### 4. JACOB BLACK AS BOTH A ROMANTIC HERO AND A PROTECTIVE GENTLEMAN

If Edward presents features which render him closer to both Heathcliff and Edgar, Jacob, despite being Edward's rival, also shares traits pertaining to both male characters in Brontë's novel. In the first volume of the *Twilight* series, Jacob plays a minor role as a member of the Native-American tribe of the Quileutes and is also Bella's childhood friend. During Edward's absence, Jacob helps Bella struggle through her depression over losing Edward, and although Jacob is in love with Bella, at first she only considers him one of her best friends. Even if

he is a mortal being unlike Edward, Jacob, along with the rest of his tribe members, can shift into a wolf. Nonetheless, despite the fact they are supernatural creatures, werewolves are not immortal and are considered ancestral rivals of revenants. In *Eclipse*, Bella finally realises she is also in love with Jacob, even though her feelings are overpowered by her devotion to Edward Cullen.

Although the bond uniting Bella and Edward presents important similarities with the relationship established between Cathy and Heathcliff in *Wuthering Heights*, Jacob presents a striking resemblance with Brontë's dark hero, Heathcliff. If Heathcliff is a gypsy orphan, Jacob belongs to a tribe of Native-Americans, thus they are both often set apart from the mainstream group. If Heathcliff lives in the stables beside Wuthering Heights, Jacob's dwellings are located in the reservation of La Push, where he lives with the rest of his family. Unlike Edward, Jacob and the rest of werewolves are often unstable and rebellious to the extent Edward confesses werewolves are perfectly capable of killing anyone when they are under the influence of the moon. Consequently, Edward strongly warns Bella not to spend too much time with Jacob in the reservation for the sake of her own safety. As opposed to Edward's noble and upper-class manners, Jacob is often straightforward and direct, and scorns Bella's will to become part of the Cullens family. Since both Bella and Jacob have known each other since childhood, like Cathy and Heathcliff in Brontë's novel, they maintain a special bond and complicity, as Bella admits she feels irresponsible, immature and released when she spends her time with Jacob, as if she was a child again. Like Heathcliff, Jacob also presents a special connection with nature which renders him strong and instinctive. Moreover, his love for Bella is primarily based on passion and ardour so that he does not hesitate to be mean and mischievous, if necessary, to gain Bella's love over Edward. The singular bond that ties Jacob to nature enables him to identify the person he may call his soul mate as a werewolf, which he defines as follows to Bella:

'It's so hard to describe. It's not like love at first sight, really. It's more like...gravity moves. When you see her, suddenly it's not the earth holding you anymore. She does. And nothing matters more than her. And you would do anything for her, be anything for her...You become whatever she needs you to be, whether that's a protector, or a lover, or a friend, or a brother' (156).

Jacob's description of a soul mate is fairly reminiscent of Heathcliff's words after Cathy's death, when he wishes her ghostly presence would haunt him for all eternity. Even if Jacob does not concede Bella is his soul mate, he acknowledges his love for Bella and lets her know that, were it not for Edward,

he is convinced they would lead a happy life together because he can sense this is what things would be like if they were to follow nature's dictates. Likewise, even though Bella admits she sometimes feels afraid among werewolves, she finally realises she is also in love with Jacob despite the fact that she inevitably feels the need to marry Edward. The way Bella feels when she is with Jacob - released and unconstrained - is thus strongly reminiscent of the way Cathy feels when she is with Heathcliff in the moors as opposed to Edgar. Jacob's accurate description of the werewolves' way to know their soul mate, given its intrinsic identification, seems to refer back to Cathy's epiphanic revelation to Ellen, exclaiming: "Nelly, I *am* Heathcliff - he's always, always in my mind - not as a pleasure, any more than I am always a pleasure to myself - but, as my own being" (87). Actually, it is by means of Cathy's confession that she acknowledges her unbreakable identification with Heathcliff.

The explicit rivalry established between Edward and Jacob is overtly indebted to the enmity that separates Edgar from Heathcliff. Nonetheless, even if Jacob shares many of Heathcliff's qualities, several features also render him close to Edgar. As opposed to Edward, Jacob is mortal and as such does not entirely belong to the underworld. Conversely, despite his strong and bellicose appearance, Jacob is truly more fragile than Edward as he is constantly exposed to danger in the course of their fight against the newborn vampires. As a matter of fact, Jacob gets seriously injured when he tries to defend one of his female relatives in their fight to defeat the wicked vampires threatening to invade Forks. Jacob's vulnerability in comparison with Edward renders him closer to Edgar than Heathcliff. Similarly, as Hindley approves of Edgar but looks down on Heathcliff, Bella's father, Charlie, also holds Jacob in a high opinion, since he is a close friend of Jacob's father, whereas he advises Bella not to see Edward so often, especially after Bella attempted to commit suicide after Edward left. Likewise, should she choose Jacob over Edward, Bella is aware of the fact that she would have an uncomplicated relationship with a mortal being so that she would not have to sacrifice her life for the sake of love. As is the case with Cathy with regard to Edgar, Jacob may provide Bella with security and protection, and she knows her relatives would gladly approve of Jacob to become part of the family.

## 5. FURTHER CASES OF INTERTEXTUALITY

In addition to explicit similarities among all the main characters, some particular episodes in Meyer's novel seem especially indebted to Brontë's novel. The enmity existing between Edward and Jacob, and, by extension, between vampires and werewolves, is often illustrated through the territories assigned to

each faction, which bear a close resemblance with the rivalry established between the Earnshaws' house, Wuthering Heights, and the Lintons' manor, Thrushcross Grange. The treaty established between vampires and werewolves forbids going beyond the boundaries separating their respective territories. Bella is the only one enabled to trespass the limits surrounding the reservation of the werewolves, La Push, in order to see Jacob. Bella often laughs at the fact Edward has to deliver her near the frontier, as he is unable to trespass the limits, so that she exclaims "it was all very childish. Why on earth should Edward have to leave for Jacob to come over? Weren't we past this kind of immaturity?" (190). This rivalry is further explored through the metaphors of fire and ice, and light and darkness, as Edward's touch is extremely cold as opposed to Jacob's warmth, and Edward belongs to the underworld and darkness, while Bella often describes Jacob as "my replacement sun" (438).

Moreover, in Brontë's novel, Heathcliff and Cathy decide to remain behind the scenes while a party is being held at Thrushcross Grange. Both are attacked by dogs, and Cathy is taken inside to treat her injury, whereas Heathcliff is soon expelled from the manor. Heathcliff swears not to set foot in the house again, in clear resemblance with the agreement established between both factions in Meyer's novel. Moreover, the attraction both Heathcliff and Cathy feel for the magnificence and sumptuousness of the Lintons' house closely matches the awe and respect all Bella's classmates show regarding the Cullens' abodes when they are invited to join a party in their mansion after their high school graduation ceremony. Jacob's presence in the party, especially when Bella has acknowledged her love for him, is also reminiscent of the party held at the Lintons which Heathcliff attends soon after his return, thus causing an important upheaval.

As a result of jealousy, Heathcliff scolds Cathy's behaviour when she spends much time with Edgar and begins to acquire polite manners that set her apart from him. Consequently, Cathy soon retaliates as she feels ashamed of Heathcliff once she is initiated in manners and comes out in society. This argument between Heathcliff and Cathy also resembles that of Jacob and Bella, when he tries to kiss her and she harshly reprimands him despite her evident attraction towards him. Conversely, Edward, through his capacity to read people's minds, is able to witness Jacob kissing Bella and Jacob's obvious passionate feelings for her. This situation bears a close resemblance with the episode in Brontë's novel in which Heathcliff overhears Catherine telling Nelly she would degrade herself marrying him. Even though Heathcliff does not possess Edward's gift of mind-reading, like Edward, he also overhears Kathy's declaration stating she also loves somebody else. This scene propels the rivalry between both opponents to the

extent Heathcliff decides to take revenge marrying Edgar's sister, Isabella, while Jacob designs a dubious strategy to win Bella and defeat Edward. Jacob intends to make Bella believe he will let himself to be killed in the battle with the newborn vampires since nothing else matters after Bella has decided to choose Edward over him. Frightened by Jacob's intention, Bella eventually confesses she also loves him and obliges him to promise him he will return alive. Obviously, Jacob knows Edward may be reading his mind and thus gaining insight into the fact he kissed Bella even if she was already engaged to Edward.

Subsequently, this enduring rivalry is gradually soothed. When Heathcliff returns having acquired some wealth, he purchases *Wuthering Heights* so as to pay off Hindley's debts. It is at this moment when Heathcliff clearly resembles Edward Cullen, taking into consideration the singular contrast established between manners as a gentleman and his truly dark nature. Thus, legally, Heathcliff acquires some status in Cathy's own family, as a result of which his relationship with Edgar gets on better terms. In Meyer's novel, Edward and Jacob also come closer when they are obliged to make a deal to fight together against an army of opponent newborn vampires. Furthermore, as Cathy marries Edgar and Heathcliff marries Isabella, both families become entangled as this connection will reverberate in subsequent generations with Hareton, Catherine and Linton. Even if Heathcliff and Cathy cannot be together during their lifetime, Cathy's daughter, Catherine, and Hindley's son, Hareton, who strongly resembles Heathcliff's bellicose manners and darkish nature, eventually get married after Heathcliff's son's demise.

Similarly, even though Bella finally marries Edward instead of Jacob, in the last volume of the *Twilight* series entitled *Breaking Dawn*, Bella gives birth to Renesmee, who is ultimately Jacob's soul mate. This circularity and mixture of different generations in Meyer's novel also recalls the intermarriages established between the Earnshaws and the Lintons at the end of *Wuthering Heights*. As the second generation of the main characters matures, their members emerge as combinations of their progenitors' qualities, weaknesses and strengths, social status and humbleness, kindness and hostility, which come hand in hand with the underlying discourse of Meyer's *Twilight* series. This never-ending circularity and celebration of renewal is further explored in *Breaking Dawn*, the last novel of the series, in which Edward finally transforms Bella into a vampire so as to save her life. Edward's murdering of his wife ensures Bella will acquire immortal life and, in clear resemblance with Cathy, will remain to haunt Edward forever, as Heathcliff begs Cathy to torment her murderer soon after her death. This postmodern exchange and reversal of identities, which was already present in Brontë's novel, aids in blurring any Manichean traits defining Edward, Jacob,

and especially, Bella who eventually becomes a creature blending disparate characteristics, and whose daughter fulfils her unfeasible union with Jacob in real life.

Moreover, *Eclipse* is entirely narrated from the point of view of Bella, who shares Lockwood's quality of being an unreliable narrator. Bella faces an intricate dilemma as she is caught between two factions and needs to clarify her feelings with regard to Edward and Jacob. She constantly repeats to herself she could not possibly live without Edward by her side since she believes they are fated to remain together. Nonetheless, she also feels unable to resist Jacob's advances as she realises she is also in love with him. Unlike Cathy, whose ultimate choice is conditioned by the Victorian social conventions of the time, rendering her unable to choose Heathcliff due to social and racial differences, Bella is free to do her wish, and yet, she agrees to sacrifice her mortal life to fulfil her love for Edward. In Meyer's novel, both Edward and Jacob present blended traits that are representative of both Heathcliff and Edgar. Thus, the love triangle in *Eclipse* seems to echo both the first and the second generation in *Wuthering Heights*, through which the descendants of Heathcliff, Edgar and Cathy present features of their respective direct ancestors, and also, of other distant relatives as a result of the union of their different lineages.

## 6. CONCLUSIONS

In addition to the blatant similarities in terms of characters, plot and motifs between both novels, Brontë's gothic classic, a legacy of the eighteenth-century sentimental novel as well as an early Victorian domestic and gothic work, and Meyer's *Eclipse*, a paradigm of a popular gothic romance, also explore the discourses of gender and race, as well as the enduring contest between nature and civilisation. Cathy's wish to acquire social status eventually leads her to marry Edgar and thus forsake true love, for which she is ultimately punished, along with the rest of characters in the novel due to her choice. Nonetheless, due to the social conventions of the time, the love between Cathy and Heathcliff would have defied morality and propriety since Heathcliff was not only an orphan and a servant, but also a gypsy. Moreover, Cathy and Heathcliff cannot possibly fulfil their love in real life as they could never get married under such circumstances. In contrast, Meyer's contemporary novel portrays a similar situation presenting an analogous dilemma. However, Bella is able to choose between a platonic love and an actual love, finally showing her preference for the former. Despite Bella's latent passion, her advances are frequently counteracted by Edward, as he feels afraid he might kill her if they surpass the



limits of propriety. Thus, Edward asks Bella to marry him before losing her virginity, which, at all times, is clearly associated with her transformation into a vampire and her eternal alliance with the Cullens. In this respect, some feminist critics have underlined Meyer's reactionary discourse in her *Twilight* series, complaining about the emphasis placed on Edward as a representative of the romantic hero status (Miller 2007), as well as the abstinence message, which conflates Bella's losing her virginity with her losing her sense of self and her very life (Seifert 2008). All in all, Meyer's contribution revises and updates Brontë's *Wuthering Heights*, gaining insight into the dilemma between love and social convention, and further exploring the duality of all characters, even if often in a simplified way. Thus, despite its contemporariness as a popular romance, *Eclipse* underscores a reactionary discourse of repression about love and sexuality in a seemingly more poignant way than Brontë's novel. If Cathy was unable to choose due to social conventions and moral constraints, Bella gladly chooses to sacrifice her life for the sake of love, and thus prefers an ever-lasting pure and idyllic love to its actual accomplishment.

Meyer's popular gothic romance, *Eclipse*, with clear Neo-Victorian undertones and blatant intertextual references to *Wuthering Heights*, also contributes to popularising Emily Brontë's novel, by means of incorporating literal extracts taken from this Victorian novel and publicising this Victorian text to a contemporary young audience, even if oversimplifying the intricate discourses unfolded in this canonical text. As a clear paradigm of intertextuality in popular fiction, Meyer's novel is also illustrative of the apparent transformation of Victorian texts to suit contemporary sensibilities, even though these contemporary interpretations usually reveal more about present-day cultural and social beliefs rather than the past period they seek to recreate. As shown in this paper, Meyer's novel constructs its main characters – Bella Swan, Edward Cullen and Jacob Black – along the love triangle set in Brontë's novel among Cathy Earnshaw, Heathcliff and Edgar Linton. However, Bella's oversimplified interpretation of Brontë's novel and the disparate presentation of both Heathcliff and Edgar situates the reader in a position of ironic distance, noticing the way Bella dismisses Cathy's choice between her pretenders as remarkably easy in comparison with her own, thus dismissing or ignoring that, unlike hers, Cathy's choice was inevitably conditioned by Victorian conventions. Likewise, Edward's rejection of Heathcliff also becomes an ironic device as he gradually grows aware of the striking parallelisms set between Brontë's hero and himself.

Finally, Meyer's novel *Eclipse* and its undeniable intertextuality with an early Victorian text is illustrative of the way postmodern and popular-culture works reinterpret and recreate Victorian novels. The romantic relationship established

between Bella and Edward in Meyer's novel ultimately proves more idealised and unfeasible than the impracticable romance of Heathcliff and Cathy due to their different social class. Even though Heathcliff and Cathy can only fulfil their love in the afterlife, their escape to the moors and their contained passion about to emerge unfold a sexualised discourse that is reified once Cathy declares she is actually Heathcliff, thus contributing to making their union feasible even if by means of words. Conversely, in Meyer's novel, despite its contemporariness and the inexistence of social-class differences in an apparently more egalitarian society, Bella's advances are strategically repressed by Edward for the sake of her safety, while Bella is willing to sacrifice her life to fulfil her idealised love for Edward. Hence, it can be argued that Meyer's novel aims to underline a repressed and reactionary discourse through direct references to a Victorian canonical work, even though it ultimately presents a contemporary biased conservative approach rather than an actual portrait of the Victorian past. Consequently, it can be argued that Brontë's novel, according to early feminist critics, actually enclosed a more remarkably significant protofeminist discourse in comparison, thus rendering what appears to be a closer portrait of passion beyond death than Meyer's contemporary recreation within the domain of popular fiction.

## REFERENCES

- Alexander, C. and M. Smith. 2003. *The Oxford Companion to the Brontës*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Batsleer, J. 1997. "Pulp in the Pink". *Reading Popular Narrative: A Source Book*. Ed. B. Ashley. Leicester: Leicester University Press. 217-222.
- Botting, F. 2004. *Gothic*. London: Routledge.
- Brontë, E. 1992 (1847). *Wuthering Heights*. Ed. L. H. Peterson. Boston: Bedford Book of St. Martin's Press.
- Chase, R. 1986. "The Brontës: A Centennial Observance". *The Brontës: A Collection of Critical Essays*. Ed. I. Gregor. London: Prentice-Hall. 19-33.
- Davies, S. 1998. *Emily Brontë*. Plymouth: Northcote House Publishers.
- Ferguson Ellis, K. 2000. "Can You Forgive Her? The Gothic Heroine and Her Critics." *A Companion to the Gothic*. Ed. D. Punter. Oxford: Blackwell. 257-268.
- Gilbert, S. M. and S. Gubar. 1984 (1979). *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination*. New York and London: Yale University Press.

- Hoppenstand, G. 1997. *Popular Fiction: An Anthology*. New York: Longman.
- Joyce, S. 2002. "The Victorians in the Rear-view Mirror". *Functions of Victorian Culture at the Present Time*. Ed. C. L. Krueger. Ohio: Ohio University Press. 3-17.
- Kaplan, C. 2007. *Victoriana: Histories, Fictions, Criticism*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Kohle, M. L. 2008. "Introduction: Speculations in and on the Neo-Victorian Encounter". *Neo-Victorian Studies* 1 (1): 1-18.
- Krueger, C. L., ed. 2002. *Functions of Victorian Culture at the Present Time*. Ohio: Ohio University Press.
- Kucich, J. and D. F. Sadoff, eds. 2000. *Victorian Afterlife: Postmodern Culture Rewrites the Nineteenth-Century*. Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press.
- Light, A. 1997. "'Returning to Manderley': Romance Fiction, Female Sexuality and Class". *Reading Popular Narrative: A Source Book*. Ed. Bob Ashley. Leicester: Leicester University Press. 222-226.
- Meyer, S. 2009 (2007). *Eclipse*. London: Atom.
- Miller, L. 2007. "Touched by a Vampire". *Salon.com*. <<http://www.salon.com/books/review/2008/07/30/Twilight/>> (Accessed 26 June 2010).
- Moers, E. 1977. *Literary Women: The Great Writers*. New York: Doubleday.
- Moran, M. 2006. *Victorian Literature and Culture*. London: Continuum.
- Patmore, C. 1866. *The Angel of the House*. London and Cambridge: Macmillan.
- Proctor, M. 2008. "Stephenie Meyer's *Twilight*". *Meridian*. <<http://www.meridianmagazine.com/books/080806vampire.html>> (Accessed 26 June 2010).
- Rice, A. 2008. *Interview with the Vampire*. London: Sphere.
- Ruskin, J. 1865. *Sesame and Lilies*. London: Smith, Elder and Co.
- Seifert, C. 2008. "Bite Me! (or Don't)". *Bitchmagazine.org*. <<http://bitchmagazine.org/article/bite-me-or-dont>> (Accessed 26 June 2010)
- Showalter, E. 1999. *A Literature of Their Own: British Women Novelists from Brontë to Lessing*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Stevens, D. 2010. *The Gothic Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Stoneman, P. 1996. *Brontë Transformations. The Cultural Dissemination of Jane Eyre and Wuthering Heights*. London: Prentice-Hall.